Journal of Arts and Linguistics Studies
ISSN Print 2959-0957 ISSN Online 2959-0965
Volume 2 Issue 1 2024
Pages 53-70

Open Access

Dilemma of Unheard, Unnoticed, and Unaddressed Positions: A Review of Implicated Subjects from Shahnaz Bashir's The Half Mother and Scattered Souls

Publication Details
Paper Received:
November 05, 2023
Paper Accepted:
Janurary 18, 2024
Paper Published:
Feburary 15, 2024

Aqeel Abbas
PhD Scholar in English Literature at NUML Islamabad, Pakistan. Email: aqeelsherazi163@gmail.com
Dr Kalsoom Khan
Assistant Professor, Department of English (GS), NUML, Islamabad.

Abstract
The present study attempts to map a third position of subjects with a proximal and distal relationship with victims and perpetrators from the traumatic events narrated by Shahnaz Bashir in his Scattered Souls (2016) and The Half Mother: A Novel (2014). From Kashmiri narratives, maximum academic discourses present the bipolar justification of every event of injustice and violence. However, the present study studies some shadowy existing positions with the help of Michel Rothberg's argument of implicated subjects, which is the third position in this study. The Kashmiri literary oracles report every event from the past, present, and future in the forms of violence, injustice, memory, trauma, victimization, and perpetration. Therefore, there are subjective positions that get benefits, have compliance or solidarity, and are sometimes entangled with their fellow subjects, all of which are the center of this study as several indicators of third position or implicated subjects. Ultimately, the study reflects various views and reviews while investigating reasons for producing and reproducing traumatic events with the help of Bashir's mentioned literary narratives. It summarizes the genealogical and structural approaches of power and privilege, injustice and violence, pain and penetration, and victimization and perpetration.
Keywords: Victims, Perpetrators, Implicated Subjects, Trauma, Kashmir.

Published by MIARD. Copyright: © the author(s). This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY NC) license (https:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/ 4.0/).

Introduction:

This study focuses on the subjective positions of those not addressed in previous academic debates and foregrounds a platform for the Kashmiri position of the

subject matter. In Kashmir, the narrative strategies are full of a war-holic atmosphere where no one bothers about humanity or human rights. Instead, the only concern is human survival. Muzamil claims, "Kashmir has been witnessing intense pain and suffering from the last thirty years because of turmoil, uncertainty, confusion, chaos and conflict prevailing therein" (p.327). There is constant unrest in Kashmir, and it destroys everything badly. Hanif et al. add further that "Since the partition of the Indian Sub-continent, Kashmiris have been subjugated to violence and brutality under occupation" (p.123). It seems that the Kashmiri landscape is a storehouse of traumatic, violent, and unjust events that make it a considerable subject for the study.

There are two established identities in every event of perpetration: victims and perpetrators, which are discussed in several academic approaches. Therefore, maximum orientations of power, privilege, violence, injustice, and trauma explain the two mentioned identities. Michel Rothberg introduces new spaces between victims and perpetrators who remain unheard in maximum courses of action. These unheard subjects are responsible for several injustices and violence. Rothberg tries to justify it while quoting Hannah Arendt's views from her work *Collective Responsibility*, "this vicarious responsibility for things we have not done" (p.21). In the events of perpetration, these subjects remain in the shadows while helping in various "manifold indirect, structural, and collective forms of agency" (p.21). The study aims to unfold all those existing structural and indirect layers from the events of injustice and violence.

There is a dire need to understand this third position's denotative and connotative existence. Rothberg claims it is an essential part of maximum perpetration events. Therefore, he considers the idea of the implicated subject on both levels: on the lexical level as well as its technical comprehension. On a denotative or lexical level, "the category of the implicated subject" is a relevant "notion of

implication" that conveys the "meaning to entangle, involve, or connect closely" (Rothberg 1). In addition, Rothberg claims that these subjects initially seem beyond or away from the victims and perpetrators. Indeed, he argues for this in his book *The Implicated Subject: Beyond Victims and Perpetrators*. In the connotative view, the positions of implicated subjects are mostly connected "with power and privilege without being themselves direct agents of harm" (Rothberg 1). Moreover, according to Rothberg, these subjective positions 'contribute to inhabiting, inheriting, or benefiting from regimes of domination but not originating or controlling such regimes' (Rothberg 1). Therefore, the position of the implicated subject is "neither a victim nor a perpetrator" (p.1). Instead, it resides between the two that helps to produce and reproduce the events of violence, trauma, and injustice. These subjective positions do not involve participating actively as perpetrators or mere victims. However, they are not mere "passive bystanders" (p.1). Their actions can be considered belated or indirect, but their participation seems active. In line with this, they participate in victims' legacies of pain and loss. Therefore, their positions "are complex, multifaceted, and sometimes contradictory" (p.2). However, comprehending their positions is vital in understanding justice and injustice, pain and misery, loss, and longing. Rothberg extends the idea of implication to "a wide range of social and political struggles" and displays the contradistinction between the perpetrator and the victims (p.2).

Kashmiri Fictional Narratives:

Anglophonic fictional narratives in Kashmir have catastrophic ends that reveal maximum nodes of pain, loss, injustice, memory, trauma, and violence. The two selected fictional works of Bashir are woven in details of suffering and misery that highlight the diverse existence of humanity. Raina explains that "Shahnaz Bashir's *The Half Mother: A Novel* (2014) is the text that mainly deals with the

life of its central protagonist, Haleema, who is a mouthpiece of infinite miseries and misfortunes that the people living in the turmoil-riddled Kashmir valley encounter daily" (p.1). The Kashmiri narratives are deeply enrooted in this sort of atmosphere. The characters in such narratives not only bear what happens to them, but they are "also as a keen observer of the secret state executions, torture, retention, and custodian killings" (Raina 2). It portrays Kashmiri world with love and loss, pain and sufferings, trauma and injustice "that engulfed pure and white, rich and poor" in the long run of post-partition of sub-continent (Raina 2). These narratives present Kashmir as a strange world of chaos and confusion that is strange to the rest of the everyday world.

Kashmiri narratives reveal a constant sense of pain and loss, an age-old story in Kashmir. Rather's analysis of Bashir's *Scatted Souls* (2016) states that the world's most militarized zone and conflict area is such unresolved and disputed land that "most of the families have lost a relative, friend, or a neighbor in violence" (p.118). Therefore, in Kashmiri fictional narratives, a description of 'physical, social, psychological, and economic distress' is at its peak. Every narration has been a world of destruction and decay, leading to inhuman details, and *Scattered Souls* (2016) by Bashir accurately represents inhumanity, barbarity, violence, and injustice. However, every study focuses permanently on the tussle between victims and perpetrators. As a result, selected Kashmiri narratives are unexplored in terms of the subject matter of the study.

Kashmiri fictional narratives are disclosure of war crimes and traumatic events. Parray states in his study of *Scattered Souls* (2016) that "art in conflict zones shoulders the burden of a witness to highlight the innumerable crimes committed against humanity" (p.523). The Kashmiri atmosphere is not just a reflection of traumatic events; instead, it is "a psychological rape of the local people" (Parray 523). This reveals that Kashmir in Bashir's world is objective and realistic

simultaneously. In his review of Bashir's work, Safeer claims that "of late, Kashmiris have started writing about themselves, telling their stories to the world through fiction and non-fiction" (Parray 529). These narratives represent local stories with local problems that clarify the game of power, privilege, and politics. Kashmir and Kashmiri narratives look like a guide to an imbalanced share of power and rights. Shahzadi et al. redefine the world of Bashir's characters as a panoptic world where everything is under a siege of cruelty and barbarity. Indeed, "through different stories, the author reveals the unending pain, chaos, rebelliousness, and degradation in Kashmir due to panoptic situation" (Shahzadi et al. 9833). Although there are so many stories in the Kashmiri narratives, all these stories are interconnected and interlinked with strings of pain and disaster. In the views of Shahzadi et al., "violence has been depicted in all its inhuman ways that cement on the victim's psyche; every character of Bashir in *Scattered Souls* (2016) goes through the mental torment" (p.9840). This establishes the fact that Kashmiri experiences are full of adverse, unbearable, and inhuman actions.

From the diverse narratology of Kashmiri, there is a favorite game of military and terrorism that converts Kashmiri lives into non-livings. These narratives highlight that military and terrorism are state-sponsored adventures in Kashmir. Rather explains in his analysis of *The Half Mother* (2014) that "it pictures the period when torture, custody, and detention meant death and disappearance" (p.93). The half-mother is a format of several questions that advocates Kashmiri pain-torn mothers who suffer along with their relatives. Moreover, Bashir composes his narration as "questions the Indian leadership and democracy because it implements harsh and draconian laws on the people" (Rather 93). The author narrates every microscopic detail and uplifts its ugly, unfortunate, and illegitimate happenstances. Rather winds up his argument about Bashir's work that "suffering and struggle is interlaced in the novel in such a way that it creates painful

emotions" (p.96). This brings inversion of state propaganda in a way that draws a line between victimization and perpetration.

In his *The Half Mother: A Novel* (2014), Bashir focuses on women participants of pain and misery from Kashmir who indeed inherit what men face in the conflict zone. Hanif et al. claim that "the lives of Kashmiri women have worse, particularly during the 1990s, when the militancy increased because of hostile policies of the Indian government, which resulted in violence and brutality" (p.123). Women in Kashmir are the ultimate pain bearers of maximum events of violence and injustice. They face double tragic situations, one due to the loss of loved ones and the second due to the aftermath of the problems created by the military and militants. Moreover, women in Kashmir, "compared to men, have been at a loss while losing husbands and sons in blind aggression of war" (Hanif et al. 123). This aggression of war dissolves women's identities, and they remain moving as dummies. These women have familiar names like half-mothers and half-widows that "depict their individual trauma as well as collective trauma that leads to identity change" (Hanif et al. 129). This changed identity remains like inhuman participants or non-existing participants of the Kashmiri community.

With versatile narratology stratifications, Kashmiri fictional narratives encircle what is happening in Kashmir, an entire world of traumatic events with glimpses of injustice, memory, responsibility, loss, and so on. However, in every academic approach, the central argument revisits the positions of victims and perpetrators without considering a bridging, third participatory force of action that is the subject matter of this study. Therefore, the study has a solid argument for developing the assertive and declarative domains of action from Kashmiri-selected Anglophonic fiction.

Implicated Compulsions:

The existence of implicated subjects has a range of aspects that can be measured

with some domain and areas. It takes the shift from one ideological stance to the next. Rothberg comments that "mainstream vocabulary remains limited" due to certain conditions of academic and cultural approaches (p.7). As a result, implicated subjects take the guise to whom they may suit. However, these suitable terms may come under the flagship of implication, yet the implication is not necessarily bound or limited to them. According to Rothberg, "forms of implication are difficult to grasp not only because they are complex and shifting, however, but also because they are frequently rendered obscure by forms of psychic and social denial" (p.8). In short, these subjects' positions remain an exception; either they are rejected as subjects, or their subjective positions are denied.

The shift from the subjective positions of victims and perpetrators gives birth to a range of subjective positions connected with cultural, social, political, and ethical responsibilities. Rothberg connects it with Primo Levi's essay *The Gray Zone,* which discusses a complex terrain of multiple figural existence. Rothberg states, "Within that terrain, we find multiple implicated subject positions, multiple figures of implication," and there are "several different avatars of implication" (p.12). These avatars/versions of implication are various names of estimated positions of subjects from the area of the gray zone. This subject matter of the study is an investigation of such different names.

There are various versions of implications in the form of descendants, beneficiaries, perpetuators, bystanders, and those with complicity to victims and perpetrators. In Rothberg's view, "the implicated subject serves as an umbrella that gathers a range of subject positions that sit uncomfortably in our familiar conceptual space of victims, perpetrators, and bystanders" (p.13). However, these several versions are not final tags for the implicated subjects; more names/tags can be suitable for the positions. There are different modifications in the

definitions of these mentioned names. "Semantically and etymologically" complicity is a closet version of implication (Rothberg 13). Commonly, it is defined as "being an accomplice and to partnership in an evil," but Rothberg defines it as a "state of being complex or involved" (p.13). It takes the position of implicated subject to the area of responsibility on relational grounds. Hence, it indicates that human actions are the product of implication/involvement that can be conditioned by the actions of others as well.

On beneficiary grounds, there are positions in the gray zone that profit from the sufferings of others on the historical and contemporary axis of time. To understand the positions in between and descendants of perpetrators, Rothberg introduces the position of the implicated subject. He argues, "It suggests a particular kind of causal relationship, a specificity that distinguishes it from humanitarian framework" (p.16). His argument points out that the well-being of descendants and some other subjects relies on the sufferings and miseries of many others. Therefore, the beneficiary positions provide a rich terrain to understand several synchronic and diachronic structures of injustice. With several other implicated compulsions, there is excellent potential to comprehend many involved positions with 'convergence and contradictions' while simultaneously explaining the mentioned positions. In such exploration, there are many categorical analyses of genealogy and structural views of power, privilege, injustice, memory, and traumatic events in the form of implicated positions.

Glimpses of Implicated Positions:

The position of implicated subjects seems dynamic, as it has variant versions and displays its genealogical and structural values in the events of perpetration, trauma, and violence. The selected literary texts have several shelves of implicated positions; among them, the beneficiary's position is vital and plays a more prominent role in the structures of narratives and the happenings of

victimization and perpetration. In the first literary text, Shahnaz Bashir connects several shattered pieces of experience in the form of his *Scattered Souls* (2016), a show-off of several implicated positions. His stories use unique titles; every story is a new tale of misery, pain, and sorrow. In the first story, *The Transistor*, Bashir introduces Yousuf Dar as a display of Kashmiri's complex position and states, “Yousuf had always stood by his politics” (p.8). He lives in his style; however, he has enmity with another community member, Nazir Malik, who has connections with the Indian army. Yousuf used to listen to BBC News on the Radio, but Nazir Malik propagates, "His brother has given him a walkie-talkie to spy on the freedom movement in the village. I saw it with my own eyes” (p.8). With the words of Nazir Malik, Yousuf is considered a traitor. As a result, the freedom fighters have taken him as a threat. One evening, there was a knock on the door, and Bashir’s words, “Before he could ask them who they were and what they wanted, they cocked their guns (p.9). It is staged in the narrative as an incident between victims and perpetrators, yet the leading role is played by the third person who has helped produce the traumatic event and fulfill his gains.

Bashir’s second selected narrative, *The Half Mother (2014),* reflects Kashmir as a strange landscape where every character is addressed as half. There are half mothers, half daughters, half sons, half widows, half fathers, and so on. Bashir explains this world of human community that “everybody ducked, dodged, scampered, and sprinted. Scrambled kaangers, coal, embers, ash, and stay shoes punctuated the road after them” (*The Half Mother* 44). In this strange world, witch-haunting trials are at their peak, and everyone is searching for a scapegoat to save themselves. Here, Bashir introduces a new victim, Imran, who is crucified to benefit from survival. Bashir narrates, “There were troops outside, knocking over whatever fell in their way, hollering a name: Imran” (p.54). Consequentially, the army captures Imran, and “the troops brought out a tall boy from one their

jeeps. His face was masked with a black cloth, and only his eyes were visible" (*The Half Mother* 55 56). That man identifies Imran, and the military gets away while completing its task. The mother, named Haleema, becomes half-mother while remaining alone. She explains the situation with the help of some questions, such as, "What is his crime? What has he done? You are mistaken. You know you are mistaken! Why do you do this to me?" (p.56). Nothing comes out from the side of perpetrators and the beneficiaries who help to produce such events repeatedly.

In the detail of implication, the subjects are involved in versatile attitudes. Bashir adds details about how the subjects are accomplices in the pain and misery of their loved ones and how it is perpetuated in their lives thoroughly. In *The Half Mother* (2014), Haleema, after losing her son, suffers terribly and becomes part of victimization like her son. Bashir explains, "Haleema collapsed on the dirt road, wailing, barefooted, beheaded," and "her face was pale and dry like a corpse" (p.57). The half-mother adopts complacency in such a way that she looks like a suitcase of pain, misery, suffering, and trauma. Later on, Bashir adds that "she had carefully ironed and folded his school uniform-the white shirt, grey pants, and red sweater and placed in the trunk, along with his identity card, his stationery, and the badge that said I love Kashmir" (p. 68). This box is full of memories of her lost son. Bashir creates a factor of complicity with victims as he states that the half-mother, "converses with them and kisses them. Kiss and sniff them for his smell" (*The Half Mother* 68). However, there is a complicity factor with perpetrators as the half-mother visits the police station. Bashir elaborates in the words of the policeman, "Our job is now confined to identifying, carrying, and delivering dead bodies to their families" (p.62). Indeed, there are various versions of implicated positions in the form of complicity.

From his scattered versions of souls, Bashir describes another story in which he

reviews three childhood friends who are ex-freedom fighters or militants. Mohiuddin, Fayaz, and Irshad are narrated as childhood friends who have collectively joined militancy. Fayaz and Irshad both become decent political leaders, but Mohiuddin suffers badly because he belongs to a low-income family. Bashir states, "He (Irshad) becomes an active separatist leader, enjoying the Indian army and local respect" (*Scattered Souls* 22). On the other hand, Bashir explains the character of "Fayaz Shah, who returned from Bangalore without any degree in engineering. He, like ex-militants, slid into mainstream politics" (p.24). Both (Irshad and Fayaz) join the left and right-wing politics, but Mohiuddin is picked up by the army and beaten badly. In the words of Bashir, "It was not Ghulam Mohiuddin in his auto who bounded up the road. There were two army cars instead" (p.31). In his narrative structure, Bashir unfolds several layers of victimization and perpetration structures that are brought out due to the help of various bystanders and beneficiaries like Irshad and Fayaz.

Bashir develops his narrative in a way that includes every aspect of the Kashmiri community. In constructing the character of the half-mother, he considers every spatial, temporal, and personal note that is in some way part of perpetration activities. Through the half-mother, he tries to justify every participant's limit and domain of action. The half-mother visits 'news agencies' of all kinds, then she researches the notorious "Papa 2" investigation cell, moves to "the army hospital," and ends with several visits to various Indian jail cells (p.76). After all the visits, Bashir quotes the words of the half-mother that "inside, captive young boys and men recovered from custodial torture, only to become fit again for further interrogations and torture" (*The Half Mother* 77). These places look like different participating channels in the perpetration events. One place is a modified version of the earlier version with structural continuity. Bashir narrates the situation of the half-mother: "Haleema saw limbless, fingerless, nailless,

toothless, eyeless, earless detainees- a variety of wriggling, howling, yowling amputated souls. A cold flux ran down her spine. The scene dazed her" (p.77). While standing among such a desperate community of victims, Haleema takes everyone like Imran and develops a strange complicity of pain. In such an environment, Bashir connects pain with pain, death with death, and suffering with suffering, ultimately resulting in a communal and unified destructed community. In exploring complicity, Bashir identifies a factor of compliance on an international and globalized level. In his *Scattered Souls* (2016), Bashir foregrounds the situation as "US President Obama was visiting India, and stone-pelting in Kashmir would invite his attention. He could say something about the resolution of the Kashmir issue, something the Indian state did not want to hear" (p.38). It seems clear that Kashmiris associate their hope with the most powerful person in the world and feel that he draws a line of coordination with them, as in Bashir's words, "America matters" (p 39). In this part of shattered and scattered souls, Bashir sketches a young boy from Kashmir who dreams about peace and freedom in Kashmir. Therefore, the boy, Bilal, waits for Obama's arrival, and he gets a photo-shopped picture of Obama, which indicates solidarity and complicity between America and Kashmir, Bilal, and Obama. Bilal perceives Obama as a Muslim who will help the Muslims in Kashmir. Moreover, Bashir reveals the truth at the end of the story and turns the table of complicity to the other side. In the narration of detail, Bashir explains the situation, "He (Bilal) followed each comment, speech, venture, and visit of Obama and his wife, the first lady Michelle, the couple's dance with a horde of poor schoolchildren in the premises of a rundown school building, waiting for the President to mention Kashmir" and Muslims (p.45). However, Bashir reviews everything in another way and states, "The President of the United States mentioned everything in his brief speech, praising Indian leadership, the country's economic might, heritage, civilization,

the contribution of Zero, Gandhi… it was all India, India, and India. Kashmir was not mentioned at all" (p.45). Indirectly, Obama and America associate themselves with the perpetrators, and it draws a clear-cut factor of complicity.

Bashir represents the Kashmiri position as a position/figure of bystander who stands, waits, and sees all actions of perpetration. In one of the stories from *Scattered Souls* (2016), a character named Shabaan Kaak reflects Kashmir's entire history and community. Bashir asserts that while unfolding this Kashmiri character, Shabaan "had witnessed all the major political and social changes and upheavals in Kashmir. The rise and fall of the cruel monarch and charismatic political leaders, each India-Pakistan tussle over Kashmir" (59). Kashmiris are part of all these acts of injustice and trauma, yet they remain passive, then subjects, and active, then victims. Moreover, they know facts in their cyclic history of pain, misery, and sorrow. Bashir adds, "He (Shabaan) had seen how some revolutionary events had become cyclic, how true legends and old sacrifices would come back time and again. He had observed that the commoner and the good leader truly mattered in the circus of power, that their deeds shone on in public" (p 59 60). The Kashmiri connection with every act of injustice and violence remains proximal and distal at the same time. In the same way, Bashir connects and reconnects his every story with the earlier and upcoming stories because it can be possibly claimed that there is a commonality between the events that the Kashmiris have faced.

The Kashmiri landscape in Bashir's works becomes a reality that does not exist in the rest of the world, and the same is the case with Kashmiri's subjective positions. It is a travelogue in dreams where victims and implicated subjects are in a dialogic conversation. Bashir from *The Half Mother* (2014) exemplifies it when Imran complains to his mother, Haleema, for not being entangled in his search. Bashir narrates the answer of the half-mother, "Where did not I look for

you, my son? I looked everywhere, I searched for you like a mad woman. In all the places, everywhere!" (*The Half Mother* 93). The Kashmiri subjects, with their ambiguous and complex positions, are absorbed in the events of perpetration that everything is perpetuated in their lives thoroughly. Later, once again, Haleema, the half-mother, recounts the places and persons she has visited and found entangled in the actions of perpetuation. Bashir follows the way of a rigid record of visited places and quotes, "Army camps, torture centers, police stations, jails, wetlands, and mortuaries had been searched. Social leaders, journalists, politicians, bureaucrats, NGOs, and courts had been approached. Clues after clues had been traded, but the truth remained lost in the shadow of war" (p.141). It seems the half-mother visits and counts every layer of the system of oppression and tries to locate their position along with her complex and shadowed position. It gives the impression that this is cyclic in most Kashmiri inhabitants' lives and continues perpetually.

Kashmiri enigmatic positions remain part of a constant dilemma that ends with lives in a perpetuated scheme of actions. Bashir explains this perpetuating factor from the half-mother's consistency as she utters, "I have hope. I wish to die, but this hope pulls me back. I have spent everything looking for him. I have not let my feet rest anywhere. It seems I have just walked and walked all my life" (p.103). In Kashmir, implication looks like a continual and progressive process that ends nowhere and includes most of the communal members. It builds a bridge of relationships among several relatives of victims. Instead, they participate in each other's sorrow and suffering as Bashir adds, "She now knew relatives of other victims of custodial disappearances too, and could identify terms and jargons of law, journalism, politics, and war that she had heard over and over again hundreds of times" (*The Half Mother* 119). It becomes a strange type of complicity among Kashmiri inhabitants. At the end of her traumatic travelogue,

the half-mother asserts the reason for the perpetuating pain, "I am not struggling for my son but for all those who have disappeared" (p.151). It draws an obvious complicit connection with the entire race of Kashmiri victims. It describes the subjects' unheard, unnoticed, and unaddressed dilemma of those whose positions are complex and part of all happenings. In the end, Bashir puts up his argument about Kashmiri's implication that "what can you do in a place where you can get killed like a stray cat or dog and be thrown away to rot in the wild" (p.157)? This seems aptly Kashmiri's subjective position if they deny implicate in the events of injustice and trauma.

In Bashir's Kashmiri world, different types of connections are developed, and he starts by defining Kashmiri's reasons for the complex positions of subjects. In his *Scattered Souls* (2016), he portrays simple Kashmiris as less concerned with peace and freedom. They only try to ask for their survival instead of human rights. In implicated compulsions, the ultimate call is for human survival. Bashir defines one of his scattered souls as "Muhammad Ameen keeps quiet about his problems. Moreover, wishes that he were in a place where there was no heaven and no hell, not even knowledge of self; a place of no existence, a place of no questions and no answers, no pain, no rewards, nothing; a place of complete silence and unknowingness, unconsciousness" (p.78). in such a portrayal of lives where there is no in and out or change of positions, Kashmiris are seen as boxed in their complex positions. There is only truth for them, and that is in their living and surviving practices. Kashmiri positions remain constantly in a zone that looks complex and unheard, unnoticed, and unaddressed subjects, such as the positions of implicated subjects. Bashir provides a factual definition of the Kashmiri world as he says, "Lately Srinagar had grown intensely turbulent. Day in, and day out there were curfews, shutdowns, and crossfire between the troops and the insurgents" (p.84). Kashmir seems a place of inhuman community where

everyone tries to struggle for survival, as the Kashmiri subjective positions just remain a bridge between victims and perpetrators.

The bonds of complicity, entanglement, and solidarity are also strange in this strange world of pain, suffering, and misery. In describing every following narrative detail, Bashir sounds more complex and unknown, contradicting Kashmiri's subjective positions. He titles one of his stories, *The Woman Who Becomes Her Husband,* and draws a unique solidarity between a living wife and a murdered husband. Bashir uses third person narrative to narrate the story and explains the situation, "The only person on my mind now was Aeysha (wife). Not Tariq (the husband). He quickly faded out of my mind with the news of his death. The only thought nagging at me was what will she do now" (*Scattered Souls* 85). The answer is later detailed via Aeysha's acts of solidarity and complicity. Bashir quotes that Aeysha remained "silent, though, she did not stay put but paced here and there in the room, where people had come to pay condolences, limping exactly the way Tariq did" (p. 86). After her husband's death, Aisha has taken the place of her husband and acts the way he used to. The narrator adds, "The next day was more astonishing than ever. She stood on the verandah, leaning on the railing over the grille the way Tariq did, smoking a cigarette exactly in his style" (p.87). Bashir maps Kashmiri's subjective positions so everything resembles the exact Kashmiri landscape. The narrator winds up with a complete texture of complicity and solidarity: "Standing in the same posture and in the same manner as that of Tariq, she greeted me in a man's tone. Some days later, I saw her hair cut like Tariq's. She paced the verandah, limping like Tariq" (p.87). Such agents of pain, misery, and sorrow have mostly remained unheard in the discourses of victims and perpetrators. They exist in established and discussed positions as shadowed subjects less active than victims and perpetrators.

Conclusion:

In the final argument, the study identifies certain positions from the selected literary texts that remain in shadow in most academic discourses. These positions are unheard, unnoticed, and unaddressed in this study, with various roles and schemes of action. The actions position subjects in different roles for which possibly existing vocabulary needs to be improved. These subjects are sometimes tagged as beneficiaries, sometimes defined with the help of complicity, sometimes considered passive bystanders, and so on. These subjective positions are present between the victims and perpetrators in an area designated as the gray zone. It seems that Kashmiri narrative structures are pretty in line with this third figure of implicated subjects, as they act, bear, and participate in every event of injustice, violence, and trauma. Bashir's portrayal of victims and perpetrators helps to understand the presence of implicated subjects, and the same is the case with the implicated subjects; they help to understand the positions and systematic structure of victimization and perpetration. It elaborates the cyclic presence of power and privilege, genealogical and structural production, and reproduction of traumatic events from the selected literary texts. In the end, with the help of Bashir's narratives, these implicated subjective positions provide reasons for understanding the ideas of human rights and survival in Kashmir. There are answers from Kashmiri narration about why they are sieged, imprisoned, sentenced, and cloned for so long in the course of history.

References:

Arendt, H. (1987). Collective responsibility. In *Amor Mundi: Explorations in the faith and thought of Hannah Arendt* (pp. 43–50). Dordrecht: Springer Netherlands.

Bashir Shahnaz. (2014). The Half Mother: A Novel. Hachette, India.

Bashir Shahnaz. (2016). Scattered Souls. HarperCollins.

Hanif, S., & Ahmed, M. L. (2020). 'Half Widows and Half Mothers': Traumatic voices of women from the literary narratives of Jammu and Kashmir. *Global Language Review*, *4*, 123-130.

Levi, P. (2002). The gray zone. In *The Holocaust* (pp. 261–282). Routledge.

Mehmood, T. (2021). *'Memory and ''Trauma in Shahnaz Bashir's Mother and Mirza* (Doctoral dissertation).

Muzamil, G. T. Axis of Resistance: A Study of Despair, Melancholy, and Disheartedness in Shahnaz Bashir's novel The Half Mother.

Parray, A. H. The Cost of Living in A Conflict Zone: A Study of Shahnaz Bashir's Scattered Souls. *The Creative Launcher*, *2*(4), 523–529.

Rather, Ahmad Muzaffar. (2016). The Half Mother: An Epitome of Motherly Love. IJELR.

Rather, M. N. (2017). Conflict in Paradise and Victimised Women: An Analysis of Select Short Stories from Shahnaz Bashir's Scattered Souls. *Veda's Journal of English Language and Literature-JOELL (VEDA Publications)*, *4*(4), 118–123.

Rothberg, M. (2019). *The implicated subject: Beyond victims and perpetrators*. Stanford University Press.

Safeer, Bhat. *Scattered Souls: A Review*. Kashmir Reader. 2017

Shahzadi, H. A., Hayat, M., & Akhter, S. (2021). Panopticism In Bashir's Scattered Souls: A Trauma Study. *Turkish Online Journal of Qualitative Inquiry*, *12*(7).

Whitehall, D. (2022). The Implicated Subject: Beyond Victims and Perpetrators, written by Michael Rothberg. *Journal of the History of International Law/Revue d'histoire du droit international*, *24*(1), 135-141.