Journal of Arts and Linguistics Studies
ISSN Print 2959-0957 ISSN Online 2959-0965
Volume 2 Issue 1 2024
Pages 325-341

Open Access

A Critical Appraisal on Perspective Relations between Modernism and Postmodernism: Highlighting the Case of ELT Pedagogical Practices

Publication Details
Paper Received:
December 20, 2023
Paper Accepted:
Feburary 25, 2024
Paper Published:
March 05, 2024

Ali Siddiqui
PhD Scholar- Institute of English Language and Literature (IELL), University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Sindh, Pakistan.
Ajab Ali Lashari
PhD Scholar- Institute of English Language and Literature (IELL), University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Sindh, Pakistan.
Ahmed Bux Dahani
Lecturer Shaheed Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto Medical University Larkana, Pakistan.
Corresponding email: scorpion_king2893@outlook.com

Abstract
As a result of offering Modernism and Postmodernism for various viewpoints on social life, different lifestyles and ways of thoughts have been developed. Modernism, which evolved because of Enlightenment after the end of the seventeenth century, has taken root in many aspects of society. Modernism taken to its next stage is what is known as postmodernism. Every aspect of life has benefited from both thought patterns, which has had an impact on the learning patterns in education. The key components of postmodern education and current culture have been blended and are being incorporated into educational initiatives. This article examines the connection that exists between postmodernist thought and modernism from past times to the current, and their influence on English language teaching (ELT) practices. The present research, which relies on a survey design, used the documentary survey technique. As a result, the idea of incorporating postmodernism into all parts of our life, including education, intends to awaken us. Without even realizing it, it is soaked with the change in society values, and one has even ceased to show concern about it.
Keywords: Learning, Modernism, Pedagogical, Post-Modernism, Reflections.

Published by MIARD. Copyright: © the author(s). This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY NC) license (https:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/ 4.0/).

Introduction:

Modernism became an alternate viewpoint in the classroom instruction pattern in the 1970s. This era has been described as postmodernism by all specialists of

the subjects. Modernism is seen as being organized and responded to by postmodernism, which then divides modernity (Lashari et al., 2023a). The relationship between both postmodernism and modernism needs to be examined since postmodernism is being researched through the different visual mediums in the twenty-first century (Lashari & Umrani, 2023). The generating principle drives the activity, while the consuming principle has become more important in the postmodernist age. Harper (1997) asserts that this was a time when superficial issues were more important and unconventional in all facets of society, and that higher explanations were neglected, and the basic framework was lost. Instead of focusing on in-depth explanations, they were seen as ordinary topics that had been on the agenda.

It is speculated that this era may be considered as a consumer-culture due to the acceptance as it accompanied the postmodernist period in society as well as the changing cultural, interpersonal, and financial institutions at all tiers of society within the context of the period's effects (Lashari et al., 2023b). The age of postmodernism has a framework that supports consumerism in terms of its growth, production, and dynamics. Because of this, it is first required to provide meaning to every aspect of life to construct and develop an adequate value for it. Modernity, according to Aslan and Aydin (2016), affects people first and foremost, but it also has an influence on the human world since it fosters positivist theory, techno-centrism, globalism, and rationalism. The study intends to critically appraise the perspective-relations between the notions of Modernism and Postmodernism through their pedagogical implications.

In other words, postmodernism is the endeavor by society to institutionalize the idea of "modernism" through the use of "cultural- society" and what it consumes in this way. The society known as the "cultural society" is made up of those who produce and consume popular goods without much consideration for the

production of significant cultural products, as well as in any recognition of universities or other publishing companies that are native to the region and utilize every kind of media organizations in a unique social substructure (Harvey, 1997). The study of how postmodernism influences societies through education and the utilization of visual media is important and therefore it is highlighted in this study.

Research Objectives:

- To find the relation of modernism and postmodernism through changing perceptions of people in different eras through ELT practices.
- To highlight the pedagogical implications between the relation of modernism and postmodernism through ELT practices.

Research Questions

1. How the relation between the modernism and postmodernism is reflected through the changing perceptions of people in different eras through ELT practices?
2. What are the pedagogical implications between the relation of modernism and postmodernism through ELT practices?

Review of Literature:

Essence of Modernism:

Aslan (2013) defined the concept of Modernism in terms of English terminology that has been equivalent to the term, "enlightenment". The Latin term "modo" was used to create the English word "modern," which indicates to *modernus* meaning that divides the past from the present. According to Kızılçelik (1996), the word "new" in current use describes a future that is further distant from the present. This situation resulted from a significant shift that had an impact on both humans and their natural environment. Being in a distinctive modern setting that is not a remnant of the past, is the concept of modernism (Yildrim, 2009). Jürgen

Habermas characterized modernism towards the result of a belief as if a person is willing to adjust everything that one wishes and states one can practice everything by utilizing his mind in an article entitled "*modernity, an incomplete Project*" dated 1980, (Doltaş, 2003). Changes to pleasant and lovely things, as well as conflict and turbulence, are all part of modernism. According to Yildrim (2009), modernism is made up of people who create the social foundation for an intelligent world that is composed by organizations made up of these people.

Considering this, the modernist notion is as follows:

"A circumstance where distinctions are made between development, economic, and administrative rationalization, and social realities that are contrary to what conventional consume is present parallel to contemporary capitalist-industrial governance recently began to be employed throughout Western societies with the rise of Awakening in 18th century" (Yildrim, 2009)

Individuals' self-confidence improved with modernity, but humans preferred the aspect of narcissism in individuality. The loneliness of urbanization has exploded in their internality. Postmodernism, which opposes modernism's expansion of intelligence, emerged through recognizing plurality and variety rather than just one mind (Gökçearslam, 2005).

Counter to Modernism-Postmodernism:

The philosophy of postmodernist view is a network of relationships that has evolved into its own living organisms. Postmodern civilizations, instead of anticipating mental liberty, retain regional culture. They have been constructed through civic societies that are assembled through time. Adak (2010) describes statement techniques that are appropriate to their own living forms. Even in the 1960s, the impulses are considered as the extension to discharge one's own manacles of instincts, struggle to revolt and bourgeoisie opposition against the modernist acts within the field of art (Best & Kellner, 1998). This term was

coined by historian Arnold Toynbee. Toynbee used the phrase "*postmodern*" in his work, *A Study of History*. The postmodern epoch started in the year 1875, when western civilization entered a dark era (Doltaş, 1999; Aydin, 2006). In the words of Tennert (1997), the term "post" is utilized as affix that could be defined so far as one's choice towards an action that must oppose to modernism (Yildrim, 2009). An idea of "post" has two-fold different meaning in English. Odabaşi (2004) defines the following as "Later" or learning after finishing a bachelor's degree. According to Adak (2010), postmodernism's philosophy is investigated through the following branches: first, aesthetically in multiple forms in the fields of art and architectural concern, subsequently, as historical fiction starting in the 1900s, then morally as well as intellectually in form of a questioning that includes a discipline in where understanding has been proven to be radically epistemological (Gandy,1997). The period of post modernism was both a historical based moment as well as a significant conundrum. Aside from the human being to be accustomed to growth and change in all areas, the reason for growing the importance of societies' lifestyles includes economic and social advancements. Individuals living under the idea of chaos might experience differentiation or collapse as a result.

Relation of Post-Modernism with Modernism:

As a living context, one might view post-modernism as a sort of extension of modernism. However, postmodernism emerged as a reaction to becoming a modernist on a global scale in terms of knowledge, thinking, and morals. It is also accomplished through the advancement of one's humanist ideological basis. The era of post-modernism intends to internalize the objective bent of mind, the realist ideals and defines objective in terms to societal goals. As a result, postmodernist thought stands opposed to any ideals based on ontology, epistemology, or any ground found on rationality. It is hostile to global

humanitarian initiatives and humanist principles (Aydin, 2006). In other words, postmodernism is a kind of modernism that grapples with and accepts impracticability which exists as distinct from them. According to Kale, the post-modernist artist, this is daring and even criticizes his surroundings; he characterizes this era as past times of the future (Kale, 1993). In other words, individuals invert the signals that are components of roof, building the organization of one kind of self- image and globalization with post-modernism. The following condition not only provides those who integrate the concept of postmodern but also embraces a different way of living. They, too, live this way. Therefore, postmodernist societies use learning to corrupt all norms and forsake all practices (Bauman, 2004).

Essential Behaviors of Postmodernist View

Postmodernism's social reflection generates six essential situations on individual behavior.

1. Crashing Reality Show Production
2. Consumption is being replaced.
3. The absence of a central theme
4. Contrary association
5. Loss of pledge and brand loyalty
6. Multiplism is also included in the Postmodern characteristics.

(Yeygel, 2006; Odabaşı, 2004; Kayaman ve Armutlu, 2003)

According to Kayaman and Armutlu (2003), who adapted from (Brown, 1997), the essential elements of current postmodern civilizations, preferred to shape and style, the acceptance of irregularity and the disorder of the world conventionalized views.

Implications of Post Modernism and Modernism on ELT Practices:

Since the 1990s, when the idea of method was initially questioned,

postmodernism appears to have had an impact on TESOL. For several centuries, the English as a Foreign Language (ELT) community was consumed with the pursuit of the illusive "best" method for teaching (Kelly, 1969; McArthur, 1983). This was understood to be a "predetermined packaged deal" consisting of static beliefs, theories, methods, and techniques (Strevens, 1977) that could be applied to a wide range of audiences and effectively teach learners a foreign language in the school setting. More precisely, "The Age of Methods" or the age of so-called "innovative designer" or "brand-name" techniques has been characterized to as "the changing winds as well as shifting sands" (Marckwardt, 1972) and spans the years 1950–1980s, with the "spirit seventies" in particular (Brown, 2002).

During the 1920s, when the Direct method first emerged—generally heralding the start of this "method era" (Richard and Rodgers, 2001—many other methods flourished until the end of the 1980s. A few of these include audio-lingual, silent-way, suggestopedia, and total-physical response, which eventually languished. Additionally, both Richards and Rodgers (2001) list some significant objections that have been made against the "post-method era" and "the notion of all-purpose methods" recently. The "top-down" critique first highlights the way in which the approach traditionally has "marginalized role" in comprehending and then appropriately implementing its tenets. Similarly, students follow an exercise and activity regimen. Another way to summarise further criticism is:

- Techniques and strategies without giving great thought to the context in which learning and teaching take place,
- The process of developing curricula and other organizing and carrying out procedures must be taken into consideration while selecting a teaching strategy.

In most of his most recent writings, it was stated that any significant decolonization of the ELT method necessitates a fundamental swing of the

pendulum from the idea of method to the idea of the post-method. This calls for a heightened awareness of issues pertaining to teacher beliefs, reasoning, and cognition as well as a shift from disempowered classroom consumers to strategic researchers, teachers, or professionals in the classroom. Regaining teacher autonomy allows teachers to theorize based on their own experiences and put their theories into practice. The core of what he, after Widdiowson (1990), refers to as "principled pragmatism," a crucial component of post-method teaching that is attentive to language instructors' specific requirements, wants, and situations, is this bottom-up "pedagogic mediation."

Research Methodology:

It has been survey model research and was conducted with documentary survey techniques; which comprises of a collection of scans of documents, art pieces, images, voice records, plaques, equipment, sculpture from the past, and it also includes all types of reports, encyclopedias, books, statistics, and minutes (Karasar, 1999).

Results:

Reflections of the Modernist and Post-Modernist Views on Pedagogic Practices:

The notion of modernism refers to changes in the arts and sciences throughout history. Modernism is viewed as a positivist view in science and above the passive reflection of its interaction with humans. As a result of this, modernism emerged as a response to realism. Changes in the social sciences have an impact on pedagogic concepts, institutions, and educational services. As a result, the organization of schools that provide educational services has changed. The system of differentiation in culture, within individualization, materialization, and rationalization that constitutes the top of modernism found to be effectual in forming persons supporting the current status quo and modify the organization

of the schools. Examining the current organization of the schools philosophically, it leads every configuration, in terms of elements, and employee within educational organization to a responsive structure in terms of defining any task. To maintain the status quo, instructor practices the curriculum and the transmission of information, while students became the recipient of rational knowledge connected to the tests (Aslanargun, 2007). In the context of modernism, behaviors are predicated on a reason-result connection. It has nothing to do with emotions, beliefs, or conventional forms. This scenario is the result of an evolution in cultural and social systems. When examining the shift in reason and effect relationship in the societal framework, it can be stated that it relates to social progress and people' passing from generic roles to specialized roles, that they fictionalized in their social life in a specific way. The general organization of the schools was altered because of this scenario. The current approach to learning is traditional and bureaucratic, defending management from the centre. Individuals taught in schools did not satisfy the expectations of those that were previously educated with the concept of a pleasant ideal society of enlightened thought; rather, a world ruled by fear, turmoil, and violence reigned following the industrial revolution. The determination of definitions and responsibilities of every staff member, importance of authorization and records system for students, and dominance of independent styles alongside rules in all essential educational institutions are accepted as basic characteristics of modern schools. Following the laws and preserving the long-term viability of the present system were considered as more important than the beliefs that they held because of the development of industry (Aslanargun, 2007).

As a result of questioning the conventional educational systems, there has been a great discussion regarding postmodernism since the twenty-first century. Postmodernist educational forms emerged as an entirely novel perspective that

creates a replacement to present educational thinking (Lashari & Umrani, 2023). The postmodernist movement in learning and recognizing involves debates and queries about concepts and scholarly practices, including if scientific research is unique to individuals or certain, whether information should be aimed at comprehending or questioning, and whether acquiring should include arithmetic and spoken mind development, in addition to rhythmic and sensational development (Özden, 1999). Because the organizations that individuals construct have a culture, postmodernism is considered as a cultural entity; hence, the issue in question is an organizational form of postmodernist philosophy with cultural substance. Therefore, the positivist approach is used as the foundation of postmodern education. This state generates problems in the structure of culture and the area of philosophies; as a result, an educational strategy is being implemented that lays minimal focus on local and cultural concepts in educational management approaches (Şişman, 1998). In this sense, the postmodern educational method is a perplex. It is the uprising of oppressed populations in societies throughout history. The theory that takes account of the connection between power, knowledge, and desire is postmodernism. As a result, while the postmodern educational method helps to social transformations, it also emphasizes individuals expressing themselves and their differences. As a result, institutions of learning are not only locations that provide knowledge and develop individuals as subjects, but they also contribute to the individuals' subjectivism. Individuals who have been given this information should be able to speak not only their native language, but additionally the various languages of the other parts of the world. As a result, in postmodern education, knowledge provides students with education that broadens their democratic views and prepares them for lives towards cultural diversities. As a consequence, education provides individuals with the opportunity to put into practice a certain topic by

personalizing it (Devecioglu & Kurt, 2013). The postmodern educational approach is one, whereby modernist educational approach issues continue and are questioned. The contemporary educational technique is colored by the postmodern paradigm to standardize and centralize detachment from values and rationalism. The current system of education and school structure, according to the postmodern educational technique, are insufficient. Science and education build an umbrella over dynamic knowledge in postmodernism, promoting output through pursuing novel concepts (Fritzman, 1995). According to Terren (2002), the Enlightenment and Postmodernism contend that knowledge may be extended and globalised in usage, resulting in societal wealth. Uncertainty linked with the postmodern cultural shift has negative implications, such as a decrease in socialization within educational institutions (Aslanargun, 2007). In modernist thought, the connection with the subject is integrated, however in postmodernism, the majority's concentration on the private has a combined influence on the society's abstract privileges, cultural, and historical framework. Postmodern education integrates heterogeneous life and thought and then transforms living into democratic activities. Therefore, postmodernist philosophy for instruction is a worldwide, questioning paradigm that opposes science and other types of knowledge (Giroux, 1991). Since most TESOL takes place outside of the Euro-American-Australian intellectual mainstream, postmodern ethos and principles have, as previously mentioned, emerged from practices in the west. This raises the question: Have postmodern ideas in TESOL had any significant influence on TESOL practices in most of the world? The response is regrettably unsatisfactory; it appears that postmodern theories have not had a practical impact on TESOL, just as any other topic.

Teachers spend a lot of time in class getting ready for the major test that takes place at the finish line of secondary school. The multiple-choice structure of the English

module test is primarily on reading, grammar, and vocabulary. Writing, speaking, and listening are among the other skills that are not taken into consideration during instruction or assessment. ELT instructors frequently attempt to emphasize the exam-tested abilities at the expense of other, equally vital skills. Every student in the whole country uses the same textbook to learn English, and teachers are not allowed to choose the resources they believe are best for their class of kids. Many training seminars are done annually to determine the most effective way to teach English, for example, to high school pupils.

Discussion:

Individuals in the modernist period begin with the concept of consuming rather than the goal of achieving ideal structure and output. Modernity's main aim is the construction of the person plus the individual himself. However, the institutionalization of the system characterized as modernism's cultural society resulted in the birth of postmodernism. In the time of modernism, which signifies enlightenment, an individual may use his intellect to familiarize himself with any type of structure. This condition has been viewed as a movement of the Industrial Revolution and business capitalism, in which individuals were individualized throughout the modernist period and drowned in their internalization. Postmodernism is a backlash to modernism. The questioning of arts, in addition to architecture, history, and epistemological theory has been explored during the postmodernist period. Postmodernism society adheres to the premise of realism while being purpose to social objectives. Postmodernism is the reversal of globalization, with just one sort of personal symbol replacing modernism's fundamental principles. They, too, live in this manner. As a consequence, postmodern civilizations fracture all rules and abandon all habits. Shifts in social sciences have led to changes in educational institutions' activities

and duties. According to some critics, substantial upheavals and changes in the field of education, as well as the development of dead-ends, have resulted in unfavorable and beneficial orientations for people and systems of education at the empirical level. There were certain contradictions in the transition from modernist to postmodernist thought, as well as in the postmodern educational system's organization. Postmodern educational organizations have an authorized structure in terms of curriculum, rules and regulations, knowledge, and administration. Therefore, cultural differences jeopardize the status quo while also providing stability. They limit the teaching technique and lack the ability to adjust for individual differences. As a result, there is both quantity and quality disturbance.

Conclusion:

There is some skepticism about the absolute truth. Schools are being viewed as knowledge centers, with teachers in charge of passing on knowledge. Individual enjoyment reigns supreme in the postmodern era, whereas educational endeavors reign supreme in the modern era. Because of this, instead of a postmodern educational technique, a multi-cultural understanding should be established. To create a steady and adaptive knowledge, one needs to work with imaginative educators and the overall management. Individual differences and emotional conditions of instructors and supervisors, but most crucially of students, should be acknowledged throughout the class premises, and a flexible but principle-based educational strategy should be provided.

References:

Adak, N. (2010). Geçmişten bugüne çevreye sosyolojik yaklaşim. ege academic review, 10(1).

Aslanargun, E. (2007). Okul-aile işbirliği ve öğrenci başarısı üzerine bir tarama çalışma. Manas Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 18, 119-135.

Aslan, A. (2013). Problematizing Modernity in Turkish Foreign Policy: Identity, Sovereignty and Beyond. Uluslararası Hukuk ve Politika, (33), 27-57.

Aslan, D., & Aydın, H. (2016). Yapılandırmacı öğretim kuramın felsefi paradigmalari: Bir derleme çalismasi. Uşak Üniversitesi Eğitim Araştırmaları Dergisi, 2(2), 56-71.

Aydin, H. (2006). Eleştirel Aklın Işığında Postmodernizm, Temel Dayanakları ve Eğitim Felsefesi. Educational Policy Analysis and Strategic Research, 1(1), 27-48.

Bauman, Z. (2004). Work, consumerism and the new poor. McGraw-Hill Education (UK).

Best, S., & Kellner, D. (1998). Postmodern Politics and the Battle for the Future. New Political Science, 20(3), 283-299.

Brown, S. (1997). Marketing science in a postmodern world: introduction to the special issue. European Journal of Marketing, 31(3/4), 167-182.

Brown, K. (2002). Models, methods, and curriculum for ELT preparation. The handbook of world Englishes, 680-693.

Devecioglu, Y., & Kurt, İ. (2013). Educating teachers for the global world. International Journal of Humanities and Social Science, 3(19), 115-124.

Doltaş, D. (1999). Postmodernizm. İstanbul: Toplum ve Bilim yayınları.

Doltaş, D. (2003). Postmodernizm ve Eleştiri. İstanbul: Anka Basım.

Fritzman, J. M. (1995). From pragmatism to the differend.

Gandy, M. (1997). Postmodernism and Environmentalism: Complementary or Contradictory Discourses? The International Handbook of Environmental Sociology, edit by: Michael Redclift, Graham Woodgate, Edgar Elgar Publishing Limited UK.

Giroux, H. A. (1991). Border pedagogy and the politics of

postmodernism. Social text, (28), 51-67.

Gökçearslan, A. (2005). Postmodernizmin Video Kliplere ve Canlandırma Sinemalarına Yansımaları. Hacettepe üniversitesi Güzel Sanatlar fakültesi Sanat yazıları, 12, 17-28.

Habermas, J. (1980). Modernity—an incomplete project. Contemporary Sociological Thought, 163.

Harper, C. M. (1997). Assembling (Post) modernism. The Utopian Philosophy of Ernst Bloch.

Harvey, V. A. (1997). A handbook of theological terms: their meaning and background exposed in over 300 articles. Simon and Schuster.

Lashari, A. A., Abbasi, F. N., Kurd, S. A., Mirjat, M. A., Mehmood, T., & Ahmad, S. (2023a). The impact of mobile assisted language learning (MALL) on ESL students' learning. Onomázein, (60 (2023): June), 137-148.

Lashari, A. A., Rizvi, Y., Abbasi, F. N., Kurd, S. A., Solangi, M. A., & Golo, M. A. (2023b). Analyzing the impacts of social media use on learning English language. Al-Qanṭara, 9(4), 133-146.

Lashari, A. A., & Umrani, S. (2023). Reimagining self-directed learning language in the age of artificial intelligence: A systematic review. Grassroots (17260396), 57(1).

Kale, N. (1995), Postmodernizm- Hermeneutik ve Eğitim, Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Fakültesi Dergisi, 28(2), 2-5.

Karasar, N. (1999). Bilimsel Araştırma Yöntemi, Ankara: Nobel Yayın Dağıtım A.Ş.

Kayaman, R., & Armutlu, C. E. (2003). Postmodern tüketici davranışının pazar bölümleme kavramına etkileri: Postmodern klanlar. Gazi Üniversitesi Ticaret ve Turizm Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, (1), 133-144.

Kelly, L. (1969). Twenty-five Centuries of Language Teaching, Rowley, Mass: Newbury House.

Kızılçelik, S. (1996). Postmodernizm Dedikleri. İzmir: Saray Kitabevleri. Kurt, M. (2009). Postmodern Eğitim: eleştirel ve sınırsal eğitim bilimi. Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences, 2009 - world-educationcenter.org adresinden 16. 06. 2014 tarihinde alınmıştır.

Marckwardt, A. (1972). "Changing winds and shifting sands", MST English Quarterly 21, pp. 3-11.

McArthur, T. (1983). A Foundation Course for Language Teachers, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Odabaşı, Y. (2004). Postmodern pazarlama. İstanbul: Kabital Medya Hizmetleri.

Özden, Y. (1999). Eğitimde Yeni Değerler. Ankara: Pegem A Yayınları.

Richards, J. C., and Rodgers, T. (2001). Approaches and Methods in Language Teaching (2nd ed.), Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Şişman, M. (1998). Eğitim yönetiminde kuram ve araştırmada alternatif paradigma ve yaklaşımlar. Kuram ve Uygulamada Eğitim Yönetimi, 16(16), 395-422.

Strevens, P. D. (1977). New Orientation in the Teaching of English, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Tennert, J. R. (1997). The final vocabulary of public administration: An anti-foundationalist critique of postmodern approaches to public administration. The University of Texas at El Paso.

Terren, E. (2002). Post-modern attitudes: A challenge to democratic education. European Journal of Education, 37(2), 161-177.

Toynbee, A. J. (1987). A Study of History: Volume I: Abridgement of Volumes I-VI (Vol. 1). Oxford Paperbacks.

Widdowson, H. G. (1990). Aspects of Language Teaching, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Yeygel, S. (2006). Postmodern toplumsal yapının pazarlamaya getirdiği yeni boyut: topluluk pazarlaması (tribal marketing). Türk Dünyası Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 6(38), 197-228.

Yıldırım M. (2009). Modernizm, Postmodernizm ve Kamu yönetimi. Uluslar Arası İnsan Bilimleri Dergisi. 2, 380-394.